



An advanced, new long-legged bird from the Early Cretaceous of the Jehol Group (northeastern China): insights into the temporal divergence of modern birds

DI LIU¹, LUIS M. CHIAPPE², YUGUANG ZHANG¹, ALYSSA BELL², QINGJIN MENG¹,
QIANG JI³ & XURI WANG^{3,4}

¹Beijing Museum of Natural History, Beijing 100050, China

²The Dinosaur Institute, Natural History Museum of Los Angeles County, 900 Exposition Boulevard, Los Angeles, CA 90007, USA

³Institute of Geology, Chinese Academy of Geological Sciences, Beijing 100037, China

⁴Corresponding author. E-mail: wang198109@163.com

Abstract

We describe a new ornithuromorph bird species, *Gansus zheni* from the Lower Cretaceous lacustrine deposits of the Jiufotang Formation (Jehol Group), Liaoning Province, China. A cladistic analysis resolves *Gansus zheni* as the sister taxon of the roughly contemporaneous *Gansus yumenensis* (Xiagou Formation, Gansu Province), and together as the most immediate outgroup to Ornithurae. *Gansus zheni* is the most advanced bird known today for the Jehol Biota. Its discovery provides the best-documented case of inter-basinal correlations (Jehol and Changma basins of Liaoning and Gansu provinces, respectively) using low-taxonomic clades of fossil birds. The existence of close relatives of Ornithurae in deposits formed at about 120 million years ago helps to mitigate the long-standing controversy between molecular and paleontological evidence for the temporal divergence of modern birds (Neornithes).

Key words: Early Cretaceous, Neornithes, birds, anatomy

Introduction

The remarkable Jehol Lagerstätte has yielded thousands of fossil birds representing multiple species spread over a vast portion of the phylogenetic tree of early avians. While enantiornithine birds dominate in taxonomic diversity, a growing number of fossils are revealing that a large diversity of basal ornithuromorphs (Zhou *et al.* 2009, 2012), the group that includes all living birds, is also characteristic of the Jehol Biota. Research on those early ornithuromorphs has revealed important ecological differences between these birds and their enantiornithine contemporaries. Evidence for niche partitioning is apparent from the fossil record of Jehol enantiornithines, which primarily represent forest, or arboreal birds, and the Jehol ornithuromorphs representing either land or semiaquatic birds (Wang *et al.* 2013). With the exception of the small hongshanornithids (Zhou & Zhang 2005; Chiappe *et al.* 2014), all other basal ornithuromorphs from the Jehol Biota lack clear specializations for wading. Here we report on a new fossil taxon, much larger than the hongshanornithids, and with definitive semiaquatic specializations. The new taxon shows close similarities with the roughly coeval *Gansus yumenensis* Hou & Liu 1984 (see You *et al.* 2006) from the Lower Aptian Xiagou Formation (Suarez *et al.* 2013) of Gansu Province's Changma Basin, thus providing a well-documented case of inter-basinal correlation based on Early Cretaceous birds.

Systematic Paleontology

Aves Linnaeus, 1758



FIGURE 7. Strict consensus tree resulting from the cladistic analysis of 31 Mesozoic and modern avian taxa (A) and two alternative most parsimonious tree topologies for Ornithurae (B, C). The strict consensus has a consistency index (CI) of 0.497 and a retention index (RI) of 0.814. The following unambiguous synapomorphies (character numbers correspond to Wang *et al.*, 2014) unite the lettered nodes: A) sacral vertebrae, number ankylosed (synsacrum): 11 or more (character 64); ilium/ischium, distal co-ossification to completely enclose the ilioischadic fenestra (character 179); ischium, caudal demarcation of the obturator foramen developed as a small flange or raised scar contacting/fused with pubis and demarcating the obturator foramen distally (character 190); extensor canal on tibiotarsus present as groove bridged by an ossified supratendinal bridge (character 214); tarsometatarsus, projected surface and/or grooves on proximocaudal surface (associated with the passage of tendons of the pes flexors in Aves; hypotarsus) developed as caudal projection at least one groove enclosed by bone caudally (character 229). B) symphyseal portion of dentaries fused (character 36); sternum, caudal margin, number of paired caudal trabecula: none (character 111); costal facets of the sternum present (character 116); ulnare: U-shaped to V-shaped, well-developed rami (character 152); intermetacarpal process or tubercle on metacarpal II present as scar (character 163); unguis phalanx of major digit (II) absent (character 172); ischium more than two-thirds the length of the pubis (character 188); pubic apron absent (absence of symphysis) (character 197); tibia/tarsal-formed condyles: no tapering of either condyle (character 217); metatarsal I: the distal half of the metatarsal I is laterally deflected so that the laterodistal surface is concave (character 232). C) supracoracoidal nerve foramen of coracoid displaced so that its nerve no longer passes through the coracoid (absent) (character 92); coracoid, sternolateral process present and with a distinct omal projection (hooked) (character 95); intermetacarpal space terminates distal to end of metacarpal I (character 165); intermembral index = (length of humerus + ulna)/(length of femur + tibiotarsus) between 0.9 and 1.1 (character 177); metatarsal II, distal extent of metatarsal II relative to metatarsal IV: metatarsal II shorter than metatarsal IV, reaching distally only as far as base of metatarsal IV trochlea (character 236); sternum, outermost trabecula: mainly parallel to the long axis of the sternum (character 246). D) dorsal (ascending) ramus of the maxilla: ramus absent (character 8); cervical vertebrae: heterocoelous cranial (i.e., mediolaterally concave, dorsoventrally convex) and caudal (i.e., mediolaterally convex, dorsoventrally concave) surfaces (character 51); sacral vertebrae, number ankylosed (synsacrum): 10 (character 64); carpometacarpus, proximal ventral surface: pisiform process forming a distinct peg-like projection (character 156); orientation of proximal portion of pubis: more or less parallel to the ilium and ischium (character 193); extensor canal on tibiotarsus present as an emarginate groove (character 214); metatarsal IV, distal extension of the metatarsal IV relative to the metatarsal III: shorter but reaching distally further than the proximal margin of the trochleae III (character 255); the ratio (tibiotarsus length/tarsometatarsus length) between 2 and 1.6 (character 257). E) ulnar shaft, radial-shaft/ulnar-shaft ratio: larger than 0.70 (character 145); ischium with a proximodorsal (or proximocaudal) process: absent (character 191); the ratio (tibiotarsus length/tarsometatarsus length): 2 or larger (character 257).

Acknowledgments

We are grateful to Maureen Walsh and Stephanie Abramowicz for the preparation and illustration of the specimen, respectively. We also thank Hai-Lu You, Ya-Ming Wang, and two anonymous reviewers for constructive comments to the original manuscript, and to Trevor Worthy for his comments and editorial handling of the manuscript. Partial funding for this study was granted by donations from Doreen and Glenn Gee, and Carl and Lynn Cooper to the Dinosaur Institute of the Natural History Museum of Los Angeles County. This research was also funded by the Study on Morphology and Systematics of the Jehol Biota Projects (IG201101C2) of China and Building of Innovative Team Plan of the Beijing Natural History Museum.

References

- Bell, A. & Chiappe, L.M. (2011) Statistical approach for inferring the ecology of Mesozoic birds. *Journal of Systematic Paleontology*, 9, 119–133.
<http://dx.doi.org/10.1080/14772019.2010.525536>
- Chiappe, L.M. (1995) The phylogenetic position of the Cretaceous birds of Argentina: Enantiornithes and *Patagopteryx deferrariisi*. *Courier Forschungsinstitut Senckenberg*, 181, 55–63.
- Chiappe, L.M. (2002) Basal bird phylogeny: problems and solutions. In: Chiappe, L.M. & Witmer, L.M. *Mesozoic Birds: Above the Heads of Dinosaurs*. University of California Press, Berkeley, 448–472.
- Chiappe, L.M., Zhao, B., O'Connor, J.K., Gao, C.L., Wang, X.R., Habib, M., Marugan, L.J., Meng, Q.J. & Cheng, X.D. (2014) A new specimen of the Early Cretaceous bird *Hongshanornis longicresta*: insights into the aerodynamics and diet of a basal ornithuromorph. *PeerJ*, 2, e234.
<http://dx.doi.org/10.7717/peerj.234>
- Clarke, J.A. (2004) Morphology, phylogenetic taxonomy, and systematics of *Ichthyornis* and *Apatornis* (Avialae: Ornithurae).

- Bulletin of the American Museum of Natural History*, 286, 1–179.
[http://dx.doi.org/10.1206/0003-0090\(2004\)286<0001:mptaso>2.0.co;2](http://dx.doi.org/10.1206/0003-0090(2004)286<0001:mptaso>2.0.co;2)
- Clarke, J.A., Tambussi, C.P., Noriega, J.I., Erickson, G.M. & Ketchum, R.A. (2005) Definitive fossil evidence for the extant avian radiation in the Cretaceous. *Nature*, 433, 305–308.
<http://dx.doi.org/10.1038/nature03150>
- Clarke, J.A., Zhou, Z.H. & Zhang, F.C. (2006) Insight into the evolution of avian flight from a new clade of Early Cretaceous ornithurines from China and the morphology of *Yixianornis grabaui*. *Journal of Anatomy*, 208, 287–308.
<http://dx.doi.org/10.1111/j.1469-7580.2006.00534.x>
- Cooper, A. & Penny, D. (1997) Mass survival of birds across the Cretaceous-Tertiary boundary: molecular evidence. *Science*, 275 (5303), 1109–1113.
<http://dx.doi.org/10.1126/science.275.5303.1109>
- Dyke, G.J. & Tuinen, V. (2004) The evolutionary radiation of modern birds (Neornithes): reconciling molecules, morphology, and the fossil record. *Zoological Journal of the Linnean Society*, 141, 153–177.
<http://dx.doi.org/10.1111/j.1096-3642.2004.00118.x>
- Goloboff, P.A., Farris, J.S. & Nixon, K.C. (2008) TNT, a free program for phylogenetic analysis. *Cladistics*, 24, 774–786.
<http://dx.doi.org/10.1111/j.1096-0031.2008.00217.x>
- Haddrath, O. & Baker, A.J. (2012) Complete mitochondrial DNA genetic sequence of extinct birds: ratite phylogenetics and the vicariance biogeography hypothesis. *Proceedings of the Royal Academy of Sciences, London (B)*, 268, 939–945.
<http://dx.doi.org/10.1098/rspb.2001.1587>
- He, H.Y., Wang, X.L., Zhou, Z.H., Wang, F., Boven, A., Shi, H.G. & Zhu, R.X. (2004) Timing of the Jiufotang Formation (Jehol Group) in Liaoning, northeastern China, and its implications. *Geophysical Research Letters*, 31 (12), 1–4. [L12605]
<http://dx.doi.org/10.1029/2004gl019790>
- Hope, S. (2002) The Mesozoic Record of Neornithes, In: Chiappe, L.M. & Witmer, L.M. (Ed.), *Mesozoic Birds: Above the Heads of Dinosaurs*. University of California Press, Berkeley, pp. 339–388.
- Hou, L.H. & Liu, Z.C. (1984) A new fossil bird from Lower Cretaceous of Gansu and early evolution of birds. *Science in China, Series B*, 27, 1296–1302.
- Jetz, W., Thomas, G.H., Joy, J.B., Hartmann, K. & Mooers, A.O. (2012) The global diversity of birds in space and time. *Nature*, 491, 444–448.
<http://dx.doi.org/10.1038/nature11631>
- Kurochkin, E.N., Dyke, G.J. & Karhu, A. (2002) A new presbyornithid bird (Aves: Anseriformes) from the Late Cretaceous of Southern Mongolia. *American Museum Novitates*, 3386, 1–11.
[http://dx.doi.org/10.1206/0003-0082\(2002\)386<0001:anpbaa>2.0.co;2](http://dx.doi.org/10.1206/0003-0082(2002)386<0001:anpbaa>2.0.co;2)
- Li, J.J., Li, Z.H., Zhang, Y.G., Zhou, Z.H., Bai, Z.Q. & Ba, T.Y. (2008) A new species of *Cathayornis* from the Lower Cretaceous of Inner Mongolia, China and its stratigraphic significance. *Acta Geologica Sinica*, 82 (6), 1115–1123. [English edition]
<http://dx.doi.org/10.1111/j.1755-6724.2008.tb00711.x>
- Li, Y., Zhang, Y.G., Zhou, Z.H., Li, Z.H., Liu, D. & Wang, X.L. (2011) New material of *Gansus* and a discussion on its habit. *Vertebrata Palasiatica*, 49 (4), 435–445. [in Chinese with English abstract]
- Lee, M.S., Cau, A., Naish, D. & Dyke, G.J. (2014) Morphological clocks in palaeontology, and a mid-Cretaceous origin of crown Aves. *Systematic Biology*, 63 (3), 442–449.
<http://dx.doi.org/10.1093/sysbio/syt110>
- Linnaeus, C. (1758) *Systema Naturae*. 10th Edition. Salvii Laurentii, Holmiae, 824 pp.
<http://dx.doi.org/10.5962/bhl.title.542>
- Liu, D., Zhou, Z.H. & Zhang, Y.G. (2012) Mass estimation and evolutionary trend in Chinese Mesozoic fossil birds. *Vertebrata Palasiatica*, 50 (1), 45–58. [in Chinese with English abstract]
- Longrich, N.R., Tokaryk, T. & Field, D.J. (2011) Mass extinction of birds at the Cretaceous-Paleogene (K-Pg) boundary. *Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences of the United States of America*, 108 (37), 15253–15257.
<http://dx.doi.org/10.1073/pnas.1110395108>
- Marsh, O.C. (1872) Notice of a new and remarkable fossil bird. *American Journal of Sciences, Series 3*, 4 (22), 344
- Martin, L.D., Kurochkin, E.N. & Tokaryk, T.T. (2012) A new evolutionary lineage of diving birds from the Late Cretaceous of North America and Asia. *Palaeoworld*, 21 (1), 59–63.
<http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.palwor.2012.02.005>
- Martin, J.E. & Cordes-Person, A. (2007) A new species of the diving bird *Baptornis* (Ornithurae: Hesperornithiformes) from the lower Pierre Shale Group (upper Cretaceous) of southwestern South Dakota. *Geological Society of America Special Papers*, 427, 227–237.
[http://dx.doi.org/10.1130/2007.2427\(17\)](http://dx.doi.org/10.1130/2007.2427(17))
- Mayr, G. (1999) *Pumiliornis tessellates* n. gen. n. sp., a new enigmatic bird from the Middle Eocene of Grube Messel (Hessen, Germany). *Courier Forschungsinstitut Senckenberg*, 216, 75–83.
- Mayr, G. (2014) The origin of crown group birds: molecules and fossils. *Palaeontology*, 57, 231–242.
<http://dx.doi.org/10.1111/pala.12103>
- Norell, M.A. & Clarke, J.A. (2001) Fossil that fills a critical gap in avian evolution. *Nature*, 409, 181–184.

<http://dx.doi.org/10.1038/35051563>

- O'Connor, J.K. & Dyke, G. (2010) Reassessment of *Sinornis santensis* and *Cathayornis yandica* (Aves: Enantiornithes). *Records of the Australian Museum*, 62, 7–20.
<http://dx.doi.org/10.3853/j.0067-1975.62.2010.1540>
- O'Connor, J.K. & Zhou, Z.H. (2013) A redescription of *Chaoyangia beishanensis* (Aves) and a comprehensive phylogeny of Mesozoic birds. *Journal of Systematic Palaeontology*, 11, 889–906.
<http://dx.doi.org/10.1080/14772019.2012.690455>
- Olson, S.L. & Matsuoka, H. (2005) New specimens of the Eocene frigate bird *Limnoregata* (Pelecaniformes: Fregatidea), with the description of a new species. *Zootaxa*, 1046, 1–15.
- Suarez, B.M., Ludvigson, A.G., González, A.L., Al-Suwaidi, H.A. & You, H.L. (2013) Stable isotope chemostratigraphy in lacustrine strata of the Xiagou Formation, Gansu Province, NW China. In: Bojar, A.V., Melinte-Dobrinescu, M.C. & Smit, J. (Eds.), *Isotopic Studies in Cretaceous Research Geological Society. Special Publications 382*. The Geological Society Publishing House, Bath, pp. 143–156.
- Wang, M., O'Connor, J.K., Li, D.Q. & You, H.L. (2013) Previously unrecognized ornithuromorph bird diversity in the Early Cretaceous Changma Basin, Gansu Province, Northwestern China. *PLoS ONE*, 8 (10), e77693.
<http://dx.doi.org/10.1371/journal.pone.0077693>
- Wang, M., Zhou, Z.H. & O'Connor, J.K. (2014) A new diverse enantiornithine family (Bohaiornithidae fam. nov.) from the Lower Cretaceous of China with information from two new species. *Vertebrata Palasiatica*, 52 (1), 31–76.
- Wang, Y.M. (2014) Anatomy and phylogeny of Early Cretaceous Ornithuromorpha from Changma, Gansu Province, China. *Thesis for Master's Degree*, 1–111. [in Chinese with English abstract]
- Yeh, H.K. (1980) Fossil birds from Linqu, Shangdong. *Vertebrata Palasiatica*, 18 (2), 116–125. [in Chinese with English abstract]
- You, H.L., Lamanna, M.C., Harris, J.D., Chiappe, L.M., O'Connor, J.K., Ji, S.A., Lu, J.C., Yuan, C.X., Li, D.Q., Zhang, X., Lacovara, K.J., Dodson, P. & Ji, Q. (2006) A nearly modern amphibious bird from the Early Cretaceous of north western China. *Science*, 312, 1640–1643.
- You, H.L., Atterholt, J., O'Connor, J.K., Harris, J.D., Lamanna, M.C. & Li, D.Q. (2010) A second Cretaceous ornithuromorph bird from the Changma Basin, Gansu Province, Northwestern China. *Acta Palaeontologica Polonica*, 55, 617–625.
<http://dx.doi.org/10.4202/app.2009.0095>
- Zhou, Z.H., Jing, F. & Zhang, J.Y. (1992) Preliminary report on a Mesozoic bird from Liaoning, China. *Chinese Science Bulletin*, 37, 1365–1368.
- Zhou, Z.H. & Zhang, F.C. (2001) Two new ornithurine birds from the Early Cretaceous of western Liaoning, China. *Chinese Science Bulletin*, 46, 1258–1264.
<http://dx.doi.org/10.1007/bf03184320>
- Zhou, Z.H. & Zhang, F.C. (2005) Discovery of an ornithurine bird and its implications for Early Cretaceous avian radiation. *Proceedings of the National Academy of Science U.S.A.*, 102, 18998–19002.
<http://dx.doi.org/10.1073/pnas.0507106102>
- Zhou, Z.H. & Zhang, F.C. (2005) Anatomy of the basal ornithurine bird (Aves, Ornithurae) from the Lower Cretaceous of China. *Zoologica Scripta*, 35, 363–373.
<http://dx.doi.org/10.1111/j.1463-6409.2006.00234.x>
- Zhou, Z.H. & Zhang, F.C. (2006) A beaked basal ornithurine bird (Aves, Ornithurae) from the Lower Cretaceous of China. *Zoologica Scripta*, 35, 363–373.
<http://dx.doi.org/10.1111/j.1463-6409.2006.00234.x>
- Zhou, Z.H., Zhang, F.C. & Li, Z.H. (2009) A new basal ornithurine (*Jianchangornis microdonta* gen. et sp.nov.) from the Lower Cretaceous of China. *Vertebrata Palasiatica*, 47, 299–310.
- Zhou, S., Zhou, Z.H. & O'Connor, J.K. (2012) A new basal beaked ornithurine bird from the Lower Cretaceous of Western Liaoning, China. *Vertebrata Palasiatica*, 50 (1), 9–24.

APPENDIX I. Scoring of *Gansus zheni* used in the cladistic analysis.

Character matrix taken from Wang *et al.* 2014.

????1023?0????????????11?????????000?1010101????110?011?2??[24]0???24?????1?01?01?11?0010?20?320??????210
0230?211?????11001?0102[23]0?1???01???11?00?0?0?31210011?00110210101112210?0?1111?101001210000?0[12]????0
1?1?2?11101?1120??1?0??102?02?1?0?11?001?1011010100001